
Contents

Vol. 67, No. 11, 2020

General Subjects of Power Engineering

Centenary of the GOELRO Plan: Opportunities and Challenges of Planned Economy

A. A. Makarov and T. A. Mitrova

Steam-Turbine, Gas-Turbine, and Combined-Cycle Power Plants and Their Auxiliary Equipment

State of the Art and Trends in the Design and Operation of High- and Low-Pressure Heaters
for Steam Turbines at Thermal and Nuclear Power Plants in Russia and Abroad:

Part 2. Heater Design and Operation Peculiarities

*Yu. M. Brodov, K. E. Aronson, A. Yu. Ryabchikov, M. A. Nirenshtein,
I. B. Murmanskii, and N. V. Zhelonkin*

Adaptation of Algorithms for Diagnostics of Steam Turbine Unit Equipment
to Specific Conditions at Thermal Power Stations

*K. E. Aronson, B. E. Murmanskii, V. B. Novoselov, Yu. M. Brodov,
A. Yu. Sosonovsky, I. B. Murmanskii, and D. A. Izotin*

Steam Boilers, Power-Plant Fuels, Burner Units, and Boiler Auxiliary Equipment

Substantiating the Possibility of Firing Fuel Oil as Backup Fuel in the P-50R Coal-Fired Boiler
at the Kashira State District Power Plant

A. N. Tugov, V. M. Supranov, M. A. Izyumov, E. V. Somova, and V. A. Vereshchetin

Prospects of Using Fly Ash as an Alternative to Commercial Complete-Oxidation Catalysts
and an Automated System for the Determination of the Ash Activity

A. S. Besov, A. G. Gribovskii, and V. N. Parmon

Renewable Energy Sources and Hydropower

Geothermal Energy of Kamchatka

V. A. Butuzov and G. V. Tomarov

Metals and Strength Problems

Metal Examination and an Assessment of a Feedwater Pipeline's Reliability
after Prolonged Operation

E. A. Grin', A. V. Zelenskii, and A. V. Pchelintsev

Discussion

On the Expediency of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting
a Wetting Surface of a Heating Liquid

E. D. Fedorovich

On Mechanisms of the Boiling Crisis (Comment on the Article of E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)

V. V. Yagov

On the Question of the Model of the Heat Transfer Crisis during Boiling (Comment on the Article by E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)

Yu. A. Zeigarnik and N. V. Vasiliev

On the Physics of the Development of Boiling Crisis Phenomena (Comments on the Paper by E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Development of a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis of a Liquid Wetting a Heating Surface”)

A. N. Pavlenko

On the Problem of Creating a Physically Consistent Model of a Liquid Boiling Crisis in a Large Volume (Comment on the Article of E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)

M. A. Gotovsky

Centenary of the GOELRO Plan: Opportunities and Challenges of Planned Economy

A. A. Makarov^{a,*} and T. A. Mitrova^b

^a*Energy Research Institute, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, 117186 Russia*

^b*Moscow School of Management Skolkovo, Moscow oblast, Skolkovo, 143025 Russia*

**e-mail: info@eriras.ru*

Abstract—The State Commission for Electrification of Russia (GOELRO) is the first in the world and, most importantly, successful experience in the development and practical implementation of a long-term plan for the recovery and development of the economy of a large country. It uses the achievements of the third technical and the possibilities of the second social revolution. The Soviet Union was deservedly proud of this experience as an integral part of the socialist mode of production. The GOELRO plan has become such a symbolic phenomenon in the public consciousness that ideas of its repetition have been periodically emerging for 100 years now. The attractiveness of the paradigm for managing the future and the effectiveness of the integrated approach implemented during its development (later developed as a methodology for systemic studies in the energy sector) were so great that not only all socialist but also many capitalist countries followed it. The planned system of the Soviet Union provided record economic growth rates in the 1930s, a unique mobilization capacity in 1941–1945, and a steady rise until the early 1980s. However, in the following years, it became increasingly difficult for such a system to cope with the country's sprawling and diversified economy. Moreover, this was one of the reasons for the collapse of the Soviet Union. Russia, having abandoned rigid *centralized* planning, is currently trying to create a system of *indicative* strategic planning according to Western models but has not really succeeded in this yet. One-hundred years later and almost three decades after the collapse of the Soviet Union, there is a need to comprehend new possibilities of planned economic management. Looking back, one can wonder at the wretchedness of the instruments of planned work in the Soviet Union. The widespread use of computers and the Internet has radically improved the instrumental equipment of planning processes, but their methodological, informational, and model support remains unsatisfactory. The emergence of new means of organizing reporting and generating forecast information, as well as methods for mathematical modeling of the energy sector's development that meet market conditions, opens up favorable prospects in the context of the fourth (information-digital) transformation of the productive forces of society.

Keywords: energy sector, economics, fuel and energy complex, planning, noncarbon technologies, energy efficiency, capital intensity

State of the Art and Trends in the Design and Operation of High- and Low-Pressure Heaters for Steam Turbines at Thermal and Nuclear Power Plants in Russia and Abroad: Part 2. Heater Design and Operation Peculiarities

Yu. M. Brodov^a, K. E. Aronson^{a,*}, A. Yu. Ryabchikov^a, M. A. Nirenshtein^a,
I. B. Murmanskii^a, and N. V. Zhelonkin^a

^a*Ural Federal University, Ural Power Engineering Institute, Yekaterinburg, 620002 Russia*

**e-mail: lta_ugtu@mail.ru*

Abstract—The modern state of the processes connected with design, calculation, and operation of heaters used in steam turbine regeneration systems is reviewed and analyzed on the basis of data available from domestically published and foreign sources. The existing methods for thermal–hydraulic, strength, and vibration design calculations of apparatuses are described; criteria adopted in designing individual areas of heater heat-transfer surfaces are mentioned, and recommendations on taking into account the heat-transfer surface fouling in analyzing its influence on the apparatus’s thermal-efficiency indicators are given. The possibility of using modern computation tools for designing regeneration system apparatuses is considered. A list of materials from which the apparatus heat-transfer surface tubes are made is given; methods for fixing them in shell-and-tube heaters are mentioned, and the level of stresses recommended for individual tube sections is pointed out. The values of key operating parameters—coolant temperatures, pressures and velocities—are given, which are selected based on the results of designing the apparatuses and with reference to foreign standards and other regulatory documents. Recommendations used by foreign manufacturers of heaters as guidelines for selecting vibration-safe length of free spans and tube fastening methods in the bend zone are given. Failures that most frequently occur during operation of high- and low-pressure heaters are pointed out. Some questions concerned with the technology for repairing the regeneration system heaters used as part of a turbine plant are considered. It is shown that there are differences in arranging the repair system and, especially, in the maintenance of heat-transfer apparatuses as concerns the tools necessary for monitoring the equipment condition. The introduction of new technologies for designing and operating heaters in domestic practice will help keep their efficiency and reliability indicators at a high level.

Keywords: steam turbine, shell-and-tube heaters, high- and low-pressure heaters, thermal–hydraulic design, heat-transfer surface tubes, tube metal temperatures, fastening assembly, failures, repair

Adaptation of Algorithms for Diagnostics of Steam Turbine Unit Equipment to Specific Conditions at Thermal Power Stations

K. E. Aronson^{a,*}, B. E. Murmanskyy^b, V. B. Novoselov^a, Yu. M. Brodov^a,
A. Yu. Sosonovsky^c, I. B. Murmanskii^a, and D. A. Izotin^d

^a*Ural Federal University, Ural Power Engineering Institute, Ekaterinburg, 620002 Russia*

^b*Sverdlovskii Affiliate of T-Plus Group, Ekaterinburg, 620219 Russia*

^c*Teploenergoservice Management Company, Ekaterinburg, 620014 Russia*

^d*Ural Turbine Works, Ekaterinburg, 620017 Russia*

**e-mail: lta_ugtu@mail.ru*

Abstract—At present, steam turbine manufacturers are interested in delivering diagnostic equipment systems for steam turbine units (STU) together with automatic control systems. These diagnostic systems should be adapted to a specific turbine size (or modification). The diagnostic system adaptation depends on the algorithm type used to detect defects. The following types of algorithms can be singled out: computational ones determining the defect using a computational model; expert ones based on probabilistic methods (using the summation of weighting coefficients of malfunction symptoms and the Bayes theorem); and digital ones based on the phenomenological relationships among process parameters, equipment state parameters, and other indicators obtained over the test period of equipment's operation. The computational algorithms can be integrated into the turbine APCS and executed online (such as control system algorithms and steam admission system algorithms) or be used for handling postoperative tasks (such as diagnostics of auxiliary equipment or solving technical and economic problems). Expert algorithms are employed when development of a computational model involves great difficulties (e.g., in diagnosing a turbine thermal-expansion monitoring system or vibration-monitoring system). Digital algorithms are not related to the type of tasks, to specific equipment, or its features or operating modes. The degree of definiteness of a detected defect depends on the type of algorithm. The need to adapt diagnostic systems to other equipment involves not only the development of new diagnostic algorithms but also the formalization of the discourse. By this is meant the selection and justification of a standard state (prototype), i.e., a model state, to be used as a reference for development of diagnostic symptoms and a digital description of defect symptoms determined from the measurements and expert observations and opinions required for diagnosing.

Keywords: steam turbine unit equipment diagnosing, algorithm adaptation, state assessment, diagnostic symptoms, defects

Substantiating the Possibility of Firing Fuel Oil as Backup Fuel in the P-50R Coal-Fired Boiler at the Kashira State District Power Plant

A. N. Tugov^{a, b, *}, V. M. Supranov^{a, **}, M. A. Izyumov^a, E. V. Somova^b, and V. A. Vereshchetin^b

^aNational Research University Moscow Power Engineering Institute, Moscow, 111250 Russia

^bOAO All-Russia Thermal Engineering Institute, Moscow, 115280 Russia

*e-mail: vti-boiler@mail.ru

**e-mail: svm-mpei@mail.ru

Abstract—There are plans to do away with firing coal at the Kashira State District Power Plant (SDPP). In 2018, its coal-fired power units nos. 1 and 2 were decommissioned. Power unit no. 3, whose boiler can operate both on coal and natural gas, is being shifted to operate fully on natural gas, and fuel oil is supposed to be used as backup fuel. According to the design, the P-50R boiler, which is part of this power unit, can use fuel oil only as startup fuel during operation at loads up to 30%. In the article, the possibility of boiler operation on fuel oil in the entire working range of loads is substantiated. The boiler's adaptive model has been developed using the Boiler Designer software and the experimental data obtained in the course of experiments on firing fuel oil. The results from numerical investigations have shown the possibility to use fuel oil as backup fuel in the P-50R boiler without modernizing its heating surfaces and draft equipment. It has been determined that it becomes possible to obtain a noticeably lower temperature of medium downstream of the middle radiant part, divided waterwalls, and further along the high-pressure path by admission of recirculation gases in an amount of around 180000 m³/h (approximately 15% in the nominal mode). An analysis of the temperature operation conditions of radiant heating surfaces in firing fuel oil with such flowrate of recirculation gases has shown that reliable operation of all boiler heating surfaces is secured taking into account the scale formation condition and sufficient mechanical strength safety margin in the load range 100–60%. It has been determined that an essentially larger flowrate of medium goes through the steam-to-steam heat exchanger (SSHE) bypass in the entire design range of loads during operation with recirculation of gases. Therefore, the reheat steam temperature at a level of 545°C can be achieved even at decreased loads. The use of gas recirculation as a technological method for suppressing the generation of nitrogen oxides in the P-50R boiler makes it possible to keep the NO_x concentrations in the fuel oil combustion products in compliance with the relevant regulations (less than 250 mg/m³). It has been determined from the calculation results that admission of recirculation gases in an amount of 180 000 m³/h does not have a significant influence on the economic indicators of boiler operation.

Keywords: Kashira SDPP, boiler, combustion, backup fuel, fuel oil, flue gas recirculation, nitrogen oxides, natural gas, coal, heating surfaces

Prospects of Using Fly Ash as an Alternative to Commercial Complete-Oxidation Catalysts and an Automated System for the Determination of the Ash Activity

A. S. Besov^{a, *, **}, A. G. Gribovskii^a, and V. N. Parmon^a

^a*Boreskov Institute of Catalysis, Siberian Branch, Russian Academy of Sciences, Novosibirsk, 630090 Russia*

**e-mail: besov@catalysis.ru*

***e-mail: asbesov@ngs.ru*

Abstract—The feasibility of converting local coal-fired boilers into environmentally friendly catalytic boiler plants using fly ashes as easily available complete-oxidation catalysts is demonstrated as a way of solving the environmental pollution problem. The technology of combusting organic fuels in a fluidized bed of heterogeneous catalysts is briefly outlined, the principle of catalytic combustion is described, the feasibility of replacing special-purpose catalysts by fly ash is grounded, and the criteria that the fly ash has to meet are experimentally determined. The problems that result from introducing technology of combusting fuels in a fluidized bed of heterogeneous catalysts are considered and ways of solving the latter are proposed. The unique compact specialized automated OXI-1 system developed by the authors is presented. The system allows for the catalytic activity of heterogeneous complete-oxidation catalysts to be promptly tested during the methane oxidation reaction by average-skilled personnel (laboratory assistants). Further, the system can be applied to explore the feasibility of using ashes, slurries, and slags containing catalytically active components as cheap and quite efficient complete-oxidation catalysts in fluidized-catalyst-bed boiler plants and combusting organic waste in reactors based on the same principle. According to a developed and tested method, comparative analysis of the catalytic activity of the fly ash from the boiler plant in Yurga, Kemerov oblast, and the commercial special-purpose IK-12-74 deep-oxidation catalysts for hydrocarbons was performed. The activity degree of the fly ash has been experimentally determined at different temperatures and the practicability of using the above fly ash within the range of 750–800°C has been grounded. Further, the minimum residence time of the fuel in the fluidized bed sufficient to maintain the catalytic combustion conditions has been found.

Keywords: catalytic activity, combustion of organic waste, fluidized bed, complete oxidation reaction, methane, testing of catalysts, automated system, express analysis

Geothermal Energy of Kamchatka

V. A. Butuzov^{a, *} and G. V. Tomarov^b

^a*Trubilin Kuban State Agrarian University, Krasnodar, 350044 Russia*

^b*OOO Geoterm-EM, Moscow, 111250 Russia*

**e-mail: butuzov@newmail.ru*

Abstract—The total installed capacity and total amount of electricity generated by all power plants in Kamchatka krai in 2018 is equal to 650 MW (100%) and 1815 million kW h (100%), and geothermal power plants (GeoTPPs) accounted for 74 MW (11%) and 428 million kW h (23%). With PAO Kamchatskenergo's tariff for supplied electricity in the same year equal to 7.383 rubles/(kW h), the cost of electricity produced by GeoTPPs was more than a factor of two lower: 3.422 rubles/(kW h). Sixteen geothermal fields (GFs) with the total reserves equal to 75000 m³/day have been explored in the peninsula, of which nine GFs with the approved steam and water reserves equal to 27 kg/s and 7700 m³/day are operated by AO Teplo Zemli (Heat of the Earth) (the city of Petropavlovsk-Kamchatsky). For the Pauzhetka, Verkhne-Mutnovsky, and Mutnovsky GeoTPPs, their thermal cycle diagrams are presented and their technologies, main equipment, and problems encountered during their operation are described. In 2018, the heat generating facilities of Kamchatka had a total installed capacity equal to 1557 MW (100%) and heat output equal to 3206000 MW · h (100%), including 64 MW (4%) and 144000 MW h (4.5%) at geothermal heat supply systems (GHSS). The structures and process diagrams of ten GHSS with the total connected heat load equal to 30.3 MW and annual amount of supplied heat equal to 1673500 MW h operated by AO Teplo Zemli are described. For 9 months of 2019, 558800 t of geothermal steam and 9.38 million m³ of geothermal water were produced from 73 geothermal wells. According to predictive estimates, the potential of geothermal heat supply in Kamchatka totals 1350 MW. The peninsula's GHSS development scenarios are described.

Keywords: power, heat generation, geothermal power plant, geothermal heat supply system, combined heat and power plant, diesel power plant, hydraulic power plant, geothermal field, well, turbine, separator, condenser, economizer, evaporator, steam superheater, heat pump

Metal Examination and an Assessment of a Feedwater Pipeline's Reliability after Prolonged Operation

E. A. Grin^a, A. V. Zelenskii^{a, *}, and A. V. Pchelintsev^a

^aAll-Russia Thermal Engineering Institute (JSC VTI), Moscow, 115280 Russia

*e-mail: AVZelensky@vti.ru

Abstract—The operational reliability of feed pipelines made of 15GS steel used at thermal power plants is considered. The reason for the study consists in an incident at a Mongolian TPP, constructed according to a Soviet project, consisting in the detection of cracks in one of the bends of the feed pipeline. The zone of metal damage was removed, after which three fragments of the bend were sent for investigation to the All-Russia Thermal Engineering Institute (JSC VTI). After a nondestructive testing of the bend under laboratory conditions demonstrated the absence of defects in the metal and, thereby, indicated the locality of damage, the metal of the bend was examined in samples. The studies on the chemical composition and microstructure of the bend metal have confirmed its overall compliance with engineering specifications in these characteristics. According to the results of mechanical tests, the strength and plastic properties of the bend metal also met the requirements of engineering specifications. Furthermore, the metal of the stretched zone of the central part of the bend, wherein damage was detected, has exhibited a higher level of strength characteristics and a lower plasticity compared to other sections of the bend. In addition, the metal of this zone exhibited a lower impact strength and an increased value of the ratio between yield strength and tensile strength, which indicates brittle conditions. This has been confirmed by the determination of the critical brittleness temperature, whose value for the metal of the stretched zone of the central bend fragment is rather high amounting to at least 90°C. The results of strength calculations have confirmed compliance with the standard strength conditions for pipeline bends and, at the same time, they have demonstrated a very high level of local tensile stresses on the outer surface of the stretched bend zone. The calculation of the tendency of bends for the brittle fracture has shown that, taking into account the dimensions of surface's technological defects allowed by the engineering specifications, the boundary of the brittle fracture of the bend is significantly lower than the pipeline operation temperature, but the hydraulic testing of the pipeline should be carried out at a temperature not lower than 60°C according to the conditions of brittle strength.

Keywords: thermal power plant, feed pipeline, bend, metal, crack, testing, microstructure, mechanical properties, brittleness, strength, stress

On the Expediency of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting a Wetting Surface of a Heating Liquid

E. D. Fedorovich*

Peter the Great St. Petersburg Polytechnic University, St. Petersburg, 195251 Russia

**e-mail: efed1@yandex.ru*

Abstract—This short report substantiates the advisability of developing a two-stage model for the emergence and development of a boiling crisis. One of the stages is the violation of the stability of the two-phase wall layer, and the other is the appearance and fusion of dry spots on the heating surface. The use of a two-stage (“temporary”) model makes it possible to combine both well-known approaches to crisis analysis—hydrodynamic and thermal—in a single logical system. In the first approach, the characteristics of the boiling crisis are characteristic of high pressures in a boiling liquid, while those in the second are for low pressures.

Keywords: boiling crisis, two-stage model, thermal model, hydrodynamic model, low pressures, high pressures, loss of stability, dry spots

On Mechanisms of the Boiling Crisis (Comment on the Article of E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)

V. V. Yagov*

National Research University Moscow Power Engineering Institute, Moscow, 111250 Russia

**e-mail: yagovvv@gmail.com*

Abstract—The discussion initiated by a brief message by Prof. E.D. Fedorovich allows for briefly recalling the evolution of ideas about the nature of the boiling crisis. Although the hydrodynamic model of the crisis, due to its clarity and simplicity of the calculation formula that follows from it, remains the most popular among specialists, experiments of the last 10–15 years confirm that this model objectively has no relation to bubble boiling of a liquid. In most modern studies, an irreversible increase in the area of dry spots on the heating surface is taken as the cause of the crisis. A quantitative model based on this hypothesis was proposed by the author in 1988. However, in the absence of a rigorous mathematical description of the bubble boiling process, any model in this area is approximate and long life is guaranteed for discussions about the mechanisms of the boiling crisis.

Keywords: critical heat flux, average rate of vaporization, reactive strength of the vapor stream, liquid film thickness, dry spot, reduced pressure

On the Question of the Model of the Heat Transfer Crisis during Boiling (Comment on the Article by E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)

Yu. A. Zeigarnik^{a, *} and N. V. Vasiliev^{a, b}

^a*Joint Institute for High Temperatures, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, 125412 Russia*

^b*Bauman Moscow State Technical University, Moscow, 105005 Russia*

**e-mail: zeigar@oivtran.ru*

Abstract—Based on a brief review of the basic principles of S.S. Kutateladze’s hydrodynamic model of a boiling crisis and V.V. Yagov’s crisis models through the development of dry spots, it is concluded that the model of dry spots is more versatile and promising.

Keywords: critical heat flux, average vaporization rate, reactive strength of the steam flow, liquid film thickness, dry spot

On the Physics of the Development of Boiling Crisis Phenomena (Comments on the Paper by E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Development of a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis of a Liquid Wetting a Heating Surface”)

A. N. Pavlenko*

*Kutateladze Institute of Thermophysics, Siberian Branch, Russian Academy of Sciences (IT SO RAN),
Novosibirsk, 630090 Russia*

**e-mail: pavl@itp.nsc.ru*

Abstract—The paper presents a brief review of existing model approaches to the description of critical heat flux during nucleate boiling. In the context of the discussion presented in this issue of the journal, some arguments are outlined in favor of a mechanism governing the development of the boiling crisis, which is induced by the Landau instabilities at the interfacial surface during intensive evaporation in the liquid microfilm ensemble. Reliable justification of the assumptions adopted in developing the discussed models requires deeper and systematic investigations into the structure of a two-phase layer at the heat-transfer surface and its stage-wise evolutions as the critical heat flux is approached. It is demonstrated that it is critical in this case to find the dependence of the wetted surface percentage (considering the process unsteadiness) on the heat flux at various reduced pressures, wetting properties of the heat-transfer surface, thermal diffusivities, and heater wall thicknesses. It is also necessary to reveal the regularities of structure formation and determine the characteristic spatial and time scales for an evolving ensemble of microfilms in the macrolayer at the heat-transfer surface. Answers to these key issues will yield the necessary but currently insufficient information for constructing the most justified and complete (in terms of the number of stages included and variety of considered physical mechanisms of transient process development) theory of nucleate boiling crisis for elaboration of the most effective methods of boiling heat-transfer enhancement using micro- or nano-structured heat-transfer surface.

Keywords: boiling, heat-transfer crisis, critical heat flux, Landau instability, liquid microfilm rupture, wetted surface

**On the Problem of Creating a Physically Consistent Model
of a Liquid Boiling Crisis in a Large Volume
(Comment on the Article of E.D. Fedorovich “On the Feasibility of Developing
a Two-Stage Model of a Boiling Crisis Wetting the Surface of a Heating Fluid”)**

M. A. Gotovsky*

Polzunov Scientific and Development Association for Research and Design of Power Equipment, St. Petersburg, 191167 Russia

**e-mail: gotma@rambler.ru*

Abstract—This article lays out the author’s views on the evolution of approaches to describing the heat transfer crisis during boiling in a large volume. The preparation of this commentary is related to the publication of E.D. Fedorovich’s brief report “On the Feasibility of Developing a Two-Stage Model of the Boiling Crisis of a Liquid Wetting the Heating Surface,” which outlines the idea of developing a two-stage model of the emergence and development of a heat transfer crisis during boiling, in which one of the stages is the violation of the stability of the two-phase wall layer and the other is the appearance of and fusion of dry spots on the heating surface.

Keywords: boiling crisis, S.S. Kutateladze and N. Zuber, dry spot fusion model